## Interaction effects in graphene

Markus Müller

collaborations with Lars Fritz (Harvard) Subir Sachdev (Harvard) Jörg Schmalian (Iowa)



The Abdus Salam ICTP Trieste

Sean Hartnoll (Harvard) Pavel Kovtun (Victoria)

Taiwan National University, 23<sup>rd</sup> December, 2009

#### Outline

- Relativistic physics in graphene, quantum critical systems and conformal field theories
- Strong coupling features in collision-dominated transport as inspired by AdS-CFT results
- Comparison with strongly coupled fluids (via AdS-CFT)
- Graphene: an almost perfect quantum liquid

## Dirac fermions in graphene

(Semenoff '84, Haldane '88)

Honeycomb lattice of C atoms



$$\mathbf{p} = \mathbf{k} - \mathbf{K} \rightarrow E_{\mathbf{p}} = \mathbf{v}_F |\mathbf{p}|$$

Tight binding dispersion



2 massless Dirac cones in the Brillouin zone: (Sublattice degree of freedom ↔ pseudospin)

# Dirac fermions in graphene

(Semenoff '84, Haldane '88)

Honeycomb lattice of C atoms



 $\mathbf{p} = \mathbf{k} - \mathbf{K} \rightarrow E_{\mathbf{p}} = \mathbf{v}_F |\mathbf{p}|$ 

Tight binding dispersion



2 massless Dirac cones in the Brillouin zone: (Sublattice degree of freedom ↔ pseudospin)

Fermi velocity (speed of light")

$$v_F \approx 1.1 \cdot 10^6 \text{ m/s} \approx \frac{c}{300}$$

Coulomb interactions: Fine structure constant



# Dirac fermions in graphene

(Semenoff '84, Haldane '88)

Honeycomb lattice of C atoms



 $\mathbf{p} = \mathbf{k} - \mathbf{K} \rightarrow E_{\mathbf{p}} = \mathbf{v}_F |\mathbf{p}|$ 

Tight binding dispersion



2 massless Dirac cones in the Brillouin zone: (Sublattice degree of freedom ↔ pseudospin)

Fermi velocity (speed of light")

$$v_F \approx 1.1 \cdot 10^6 \text{ m/s} \approx \frac{c}{300}$$

Coulomb interactions: Fine structure constant



#### Relativistic fluid at the Dirac point

D. Sheehy, J. Schmalian, Phys. Rev. Lett. 99, 226803 (2007).

• Relativistic plasma physics of interacting particles and holes!



#### Relativistic fluid at the Dirac point

D. Sheehy, J. Schmalian, Phys. Rev. Lett. 99, 226803 (2007).

- Relativistic plasma physics of interacting particles and holes!
- Strongly coupled, nearly quantum critical fluid at m = 0



#### Relativistic fluid at the Dirac point

D. Sheehy, J. Schmalian, Phys. Rev. Lett. 99, 226803 (2007).

- Relativistic plasma physics of interacting particles and holes!
- Strongly coupled, nearly quantum critical fluid at m = 0



Very similar as for quantum criticality (e.g. SIT) and in their associated CFT's

### Other relativistic fluids:

- Bismuth (3d Dirac fermions with very small mass)
- Systems close to quantum criticality (with z = 1) Example: Superconductor-insulator transition (Bose-Hubbard model)

#### Maximal possible relaxation rate!



Damle, Sachdev (1996) Bhaseen, Green, Sondhi (2007). Hartnoll, Kovtun, MM, Sachdev (2007)

• Conformal field theories (critical points)

E.g.: strongly coupled Non-Abelian gauge theories (akin to QCD):

→ Exact treatment via AdS-CFT correspondence!

C. P. Herzog, P. Kovtun, S. Sachdev, and D. T. Son (2007) Hartnoll, Kovtun, MM, Sachdev (2007)

Fine structure constant (QED concept)

$$\alpha \equiv \frac{e^2}{\varepsilon \, \hbar \mathrm{v}_F} = \frac{2.2}{\varepsilon}$$

Large!

Fine structure constant (QED concept)

$$\alpha \equiv \frac{e^2}{\varepsilon \,\hbar \mathrm{v}_F} = \frac{2.2}{\varepsilon}$$

Large!

r<sub>s</sub> (Wigner crystal concept)

$$r_{s} \equiv \frac{E_{Cb}(n)}{E_{F}(n)} = \frac{\sqrt{n} e^{2}/\varepsilon}{\hbar v_{F} \sqrt{\pi n}} = \frac{\alpha}{\sqrt{\pi}}$$

Small!?

n-independent!

Fine structure constant (QED concept)

$$\alpha \equiv \frac{e^2}{\varepsilon \, \hbar \mathrm{v}_F} = \frac{2.2}{\varepsilon}$$

Large!

r<sub>s</sub> (Wigner crystal concept)

$$r_{s} \equiv \frac{E_{Cb}(n)}{E_{F}(n)} = \frac{\sqrt{n} e^{2}/\varepsilon}{\hbar v_{F} \sqrt{\pi n}} = \frac{\alpha}{\sqrt{\pi}}$$

Small!?

#### n-independent!

#### Recall QED/QCD:

- The coupling strength  $\alpha$  depends on the scale.
- Different theories have different scale behavior!

 $\alpha$  is the high energy limit of the coupling. But we care about  $\alpha(T)$ !

Coulomb interactions: Unexpectedly strong! → nearly quantum critical!

$$V(\mathbf{q}) = \frac{2\pi e^2}{\varepsilon |\mathbf{q}|}$$

$$H_{1} = \frac{1}{2} \int \frac{d^{2}k_{1}}{(2\pi)^{2}} \frac{d^{2}k_{2}}{(2\pi)^{2}} \frac{d^{2}q}{(2\pi)^{2}} \Psi_{a}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}_{2}-\mathbf{q}) \Psi_{a}(\mathbf{k}_{2}) V(\mathbf{q}) \Psi_{b}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}_{1}+\mathbf{q}) \Psi_{b}(\mathbf{k}_{1})$$

Coulomb interactions: Unexpectedly strong! → nearly quantum critical!

$$V(\mathbf{q}) = \frac{2\pi e^2}{\varepsilon |\mathbf{q}|}$$

$$H_{1} = \frac{1}{2} \int \frac{d^{2}k_{1}}{(2\pi)^{2}} \frac{d^{2}k_{2}}{(2\pi)^{2}} \frac{d^{2}q}{(2\pi)^{2}} \Psi_{a}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}_{2} - \mathbf{q}) \Psi_{a}(\mathbf{k}_{2}) V(\mathbf{q}) \Psi_{b}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}_{1} + \mathbf{q}) \Psi_{b}(\mathbf{k}_{1})$$

$$RG:$$

$$(\mu = 0)$$

$$Iote Fermi liqued$$

$$Iote Fermi liqued$$

$$Cb marg$$

Strong coupling! Quantum critical liquid Hole Fermi liquid Interaction dominated (hydrodynamic) Disorder dominated

Gonzalez et al., PRL 77, 3589 (1996)

Coulomb interactions: Unexpectedly strong! → nearly quantum critical!

$$V(\mathbf{q}) = \frac{2\pi e^2}{\varepsilon |\mathbf{q}|}$$

Coulomb interactions: Unexpectedly strong! → nearly quantum critical!

$$V(\mathbf{q}) = \frac{2\pi e^2}{\varepsilon |\mathbf{q}|}$$

But:  $(\mu > 0)$  | For  $T < \mu$ : screening kicks in, short ranged Cb irrelevant

#### **Consequences for transport**

1. Collision-limited conductivity  $\sigma$  in clean undoped graphene

2. Emergent relativistic invariance at low frequencies!

3. Graphene is a perfect quantum liquid: very small viscosity η!

Hydrodynamic approach to transport

MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

1. Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

 $\mu >>$  T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



C: Independent of the Coulomb coupling strength!

MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

1. Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

 $\mu >>$  T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



Relaxation rate ~ T, like in quantum critical systems! Fastest possible rate!

 $\mu$  < T: strongly coupled relativistic liquid



MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

1. Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

 $\mu >>$  T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



Relaxation rate ~ T, like in quantum critical systems! Fastest possible rate!

 $\mu$  < T: strongly coupled relativistic liquid



"Heisenberg uncertainty principle for well-defined quasiparticles"

$$E_{qp}(\sim k_B T) \ge \Delta E_{int} = \hbar \tau_{ee}^{-1} \sim \alpha^2 k_B T$$

MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

1. Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

 $\mu >>$  T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



Relaxation rate ~ T, like in quantum critical systems! Fastest possible rate!

 $\mu$ <T: strongly coupled relativistic liquid



"Heisenberg uncertainty principle for well-defined quasiparticles"

$$E_{qp}(\sim k_B T) \ge \Delta E_{int} = \hbar \tau_{ee}^{-1} \sim \alpha^2 k_B T$$

As long as  $\alpha(T) \sim 1$ , energy uncertainty is saturated, scattering is maximal  $\rightarrow$  Nearly universal strong coupling features in transport, similarly as at the 2d superfluid-insulator transition [Damle, Sachdev (1996, 1997)]

MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

1. Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

 $\mu >>$  T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



Relaxation rate ~ T, like in quantum critical systems! Fastest possible rate!

 $\mu$  < T: strongly coupled relativistic liquid



2. Elastic scattering rate(Scattering from charged impurities)Subdominant at high T, low disorder



MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

1. Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

 $\mu >>$  T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



Relaxation rate ~ T, like in quantum critical systems! Fastest possible rate!

 $\mu$  < T: strongly coupled relativistic liquid



2. Elastic scattering rate(Scattering from charged impurities)Subdominant at high T, low disorder

3. Deflection rate due to magnetic field (Cyclotron frequency of non-interacting particles with thermal energy )





MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

1. Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

 $\mu >>$  T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



Relaxation rate ~ T, like in quantum critical systems! Fastest possible rate!

2. Elastic scattering rate(Scattering from charged impurities)Subdominant at high T, low disorder

3. Deflection rate due to magnetic field (Cyclotron frequency of non-interacting particles with thermal energy )

 $\mu$  < T: strongly coupled relativistic liquid



 $au_{
m ee}^{-1} >> au_{
m imp}^{-1}, au_{
m B}^{-1}, \omega$ 

$$\boldsymbol{\tau}_{\mathrm{B}}^{-1} \sim \boldsymbol{\omega}_{c}^{\mathrm{typ}} \sim \frac{eB\mathrm{v}_{F}^{2}}{\max[T,\mu]}$$

Hydrodynamic regime: (collision-dominated)

## Hydrodynamics

Hydrodynamic collision-dominated regime



Long times, Large scales



# Hydrodynamics



- Slow modes: Diffusion of the density of conserved quantities:
  - Charge
  - Momentum
  - Energy

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Energy-momentum tensor 
$$T^{\mu\nu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu}u^{\nu} + Pg^{\mu\nu} + \tau^{\mu\nu}$$



Current 3-vector

$$J^{\mu} = \rho u^{\mu} + \nu^{\mu} \begin{pmatrix} \rho \\ \rho u_x + v_x \\ \rho u_y + v_y \end{pmatrix}$$

- $u^{\mu}$ : 3-velocity:  $u^{\mu} = (1,0,0) \rightarrow$  No energy current
- $v^{\mu}$ : Dissipative current
- $\tau^{\mu\nu}$ : Viscous stress tensor (Reynold's tensor)

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Energy-momentum tensor 
$$T^{\mu\nu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu}u^{\nu} + Pg^{\mu\nu} + \tau^{\mu\nu}$$



**Current 3-vector** 

$$J^{\mu} = \rho u^{\mu} + \nu^{\mu} \begin{pmatrix} \rho \\ \rho u_x + v_x \\ \rho u_y + v_y \end{pmatrix}$$

 $u^{\mu}$ : 3-velocity:  $u^{\mu} = (1,0,0) \rightarrow$  No energy current

$$\gamma^{\mu}$$
: Dissipative current

 $\tau^{\mu\nu}$ : Viscous stress tensor (Reynold's tensor)

#### + Thermodynamic relations

$$\varepsilon + P = Ts + \mu\rho, \quad d\varepsilon = Tds + \mu d\rho,$$

**Gibbs-Duheme** 1<sup>st</sup> law of thermodynamics

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

$$J^{\mu} = \rho u^{\mu} + \nu^{\mu} \qquad T^{\mu\nu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu}u^{\nu} + Pg^{\mu\nu} + \tau^{\mu\nu}$$

Conservation laws (equations of motion):

 $\partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = 0$  Charge conservation

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

$$J^{\mu} = \rho u^{\mu} + \nu^{\mu} \qquad T^{\mu\nu} = (\varepsilon + P) u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + P g^{\mu\nu} + \tau^{\mu\nu}$$

Conservation laws (equations of motion):

 $\partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = 0$  Charge conservation

Energy/momentum conservation

$$\partial_{\nu}T^{\mu\nu} = F^{\mu\nu}J_{\nu}$$

$$F^{\mu\nu} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & E_x & E_y \\ -E_x & 0 & B \\ -E_y & -B & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

 $\vec{E} = -i\vec{k}\frac{2\pi}{|k|}\rho_{\vec{k}}$  Coulomb interaction

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

$$J^{\mu} = \rho u^{\mu} + \nu^{\mu} \qquad T^{\mu\nu} = (\varepsilon + P) u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + P g^{\mu\nu} + \tau^{\mu\nu}$$

Conservation laws (equations of motion):

 $\partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = 0 \quad \text{Charge conservation}$ Energy/momentum conservation  $\partial_{\nu}T^{\mu\nu} = F^{\mu\nu}J_{\nu} + \frac{1}{\tau_{\text{imp}}}T^{0\nu}$   $\vec{E} = -i\vec{k}\frac{2\pi}{|k|}\rho_{\vec{k}} \quad \text{Coulomb interaction}$ 

Weak disorder  $\rightarrow$  momentum relaxation

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

$$J^{\mu} = \rho u^{\mu} + \nu^{\mu} \qquad T^{\mu\nu} = (\varepsilon + P) u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + P g^{\mu\nu} + \tau^{\mu\nu}$$

Conservation laws (equations of motion):

 $\partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = 0 \quad \text{Charge conservation}$ Energy/momentum conservation  $\partial_{\nu}T^{\mu\nu} = F^{\mu\nu}J_{\nu} + \frac{1}{\tau_{\text{imp}}}T^{0\nu}$   $\vec{E} = -i\vec{k}\frac{2\pi}{|k|}\rho_{\vec{k}} \quad \text{Coulomb interaction}$ 

Dissipative current and viscous tensor?

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Dissipative current and viscous tensor?

Heat current  $Q^{\mu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu} - \mu J^{\mu}$  $\rightarrow$  Entropy current  $S^{\mu} = Q^{\mu}/T$ 

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Dissipative current and viscous tensor?

Heat current  $Q^{\mu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu} - \mu J^{\mu}$  $\rightarrow$  Entropy current  $S^{\mu} = Q^{\mu}/T$ 

Positivity of entropy production (Second law):

$$\partial_{\mu}S^{\mu} \equiv A_{\alpha} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) v^{\alpha} + B_{\alpha\beta} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) \tau^{\alpha\beta} \ge 0$$
  

$$\Rightarrow v^{\mu} = \text{const.} \times A^{\mu} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, \partial u; F^{\mu\nu} \right)$$
  

$$\tau^{\mu\nu} = \text{const.} \times B^{\mu\nu} + \text{const.} \times \delta^{\mu\nu} B^{\alpha}_{\alpha}$$

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Dissipative current and viscous tensor?

Heat current  $Q^{\mu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu} - \mu J^{\mu}$  $\rightarrow$  Entropy current  $S^{\mu} = Q^{\mu}/T$ 

Positivity of entropy production (Second law):

$$\partial_{\mu}S^{\mu} \equiv A_{\alpha} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) v^{\alpha} + B_{\alpha\beta} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) \tau^{\alpha\beta} \ge 0$$
  
$$\Rightarrow v^{\mu} = \text{const.} \times A^{\mu} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, \partial u; F^{\mu\nu} \right)$$
  
$$\tau^{\mu\nu} = \text{const.} \times B^{\mu\nu} + \text{const.} \times \delta^{\mu\nu} B^{\alpha}_{\alpha}$$

$$\begin{split} \nu^{\mu} &= \sigma_Q(g^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu}u^{\nu}) \Bigg[ \left( -\partial_{\nu}\mu + F_{\nu\lambda}u^{\lambda} \right) + \mu \frac{\partial_{\mu}T}{T} \Bigg] \\ \tau^{\mu\nu} &= - \left( g^{\mu\lambda} + u^{\mu}u^{\lambda} \right) \Big[ \eta(\partial_{\lambda}u^{\nu} + \partial^{\nu}u_{\lambda}) + (\zeta - \eta) \delta^{\nu}_{\lambda} \partial_{\alpha}u^{\alpha} \Big] \end{split}$$
#### **Relativistic Hydrodynamics**

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Dissipative current and viscous tensor?

Heat current  $Q^{\mu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu} - \mu J^{\mu}$  $\rightarrow$  Entropy current  $S^{\mu} = Q^{\mu}/T$ 

Positivity of entropy production (Second law):

$$\partial_{\mu}S^{\mu} \equiv A_{\alpha} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) v^{\alpha} + B_{\alpha\beta} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) \tau^{\alpha\beta} \ge 0$$
  
$$\Rightarrow v^{\mu} = \text{const.} \times A^{\mu} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, \partial u; F^{\mu\nu} \right)$$
  
$$\tau^{\mu\nu} = \text{const.} \times B^{\mu\nu} + \text{const.} \times \delta^{\mu\nu} B^{\alpha}_{\alpha}$$

$$\begin{split} \nu^{\mu} &= \sigma_Q(g^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu}u^{\nu}) \Bigg[ \left( -\partial_{\nu}\mu + F_{\nu\lambda}u^{\lambda} \right) + \mu \frac{\partial_{\mu}T}{T} \Bigg] \\ \tau^{\mu\nu} &= - \left( g^{\mu\lambda} + u^{\mu}u^{\lambda} \right) \Big[ \eta(\partial_{\lambda}u^{\nu} + \partial^{\nu}u_{\lambda}) + (\zeta - \eta) \delta^{\nu}_{\lambda} \partial_{\alpha}u^{\alpha} \Big] \end{split}$$

#### **Relativistic Hydrodynamics**

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Dissipative current and viscous tensor?

Heat current  $Q^{\mu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu} - \mu J^{\mu}$  $\rightarrow$  Entropy current  $S^{\mu} = Q^{\mu}/T$ 

Positivity of entropy production (Second law):

$$\partial_{\mu}S^{\mu} \equiv A_{\alpha} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) v^{\alpha} + B_{\alpha\beta} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) \tau^{\alpha\beta} \ge 0$$
  

$$\Rightarrow v^{\mu} = \text{const.} \times A^{\mu} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, \partial u; F^{\mu\nu} \right)$$
  

$$\tau^{\mu\nu} = \text{const.} \times B^{\mu\nu} + \text{const.} \times \delta^{\mu\nu} B^{\alpha}_{\alpha}$$

$$\begin{split} & \checkmark \\ & \downarrow \\ &$$

#### **Relativistic Hydrodynamics**

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Dissipative current and viscous tensor?

Heat current  $Q^{\mu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu} - \mu J^{\mu}$  $\rightarrow$  Entropy current  $S^{\mu} = Q^{\mu}/T$ 

Positivity of entropy production (Second law):

$$\partial_{\mu}S^{\mu} \equiv A_{\alpha} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) v^{\alpha} + B_{\alpha\beta} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, F^{\mu\nu} \right) \tau^{\alpha\beta} \ge 0$$
  

$$\Rightarrow v^{\mu} = \text{const.} \times A^{\mu} \left( \partial T, \partial \mu, \partial u; F^{\mu\nu} \right)$$
  

$$\tau^{\mu\nu} = \text{const.} \times B^{\mu\nu} + \text{const.} \times \delta^{\mu\nu} B^{\alpha}_{\alpha}$$

$$\nu^{\mu} = \sigma_{Q} (p^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu}u^{\nu}) \left[ (-\partial_{\nu}\mu + F_{\nu\lambda}u^{\lambda}) + \mu \frac{\partial_{\mu}T}{T} \right]$$
  
$$\tau^{\mu\nu} = -(g^{\mu\lambda} + u^{\mu}u^{\lambda}) [\eta(\partial_{\lambda}u^{\nu} + \partial^{\nu}u_{\lambda}) + (\zeta - \eta)\partial_{\lambda}^{\nu}\partial_{\alpha}u^{\alpha}]$$
  
Irrelevant for response at k  $\rightarrow 0$   
One single transport coefficient (instead of two)!

Meaning of 
$$\sigma_Q$$
?

• At zero doping (particle-hole symmetry):

$$\sigma_Q = \sigma_{xx} \left( \rho_{\rm imp} = 0 \right) < \infty$$
!

→ Interaction-limited conductivity of the pure system!

How is it possible that 
$$\sigma_{xx}(\rho_{imp} = 0)$$
 is finite ??

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry (r=0)!

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry (r=0)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum!



Pair creation/annihilation leads to current decay

• Finite collision-limited conductivity!

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry (r=0)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum

(particle) (hole)  $\vec{J} \neq 0, \vec{P} = 0$ 

Pair creation/annihilation leads to current decay

- Finite collision-limited conductivity!
- Marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: Maximal possible relaxation rate, set only by temperature



Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry (r=0)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum

(particle) (hole) (hole)  $\vec{t}$ 



Pair creation/annihilation leads to current decay

- Finite collision-limited conductivity!
- Marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: Maximal possible relaxation rate, set only by temperature



→ Nearly universal conductivity

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry (r=0)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum

(particle) (hole) -



Pair creation/annihilation leads to current decay

- Finite collision-limited conductivity!
- Marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: Maximal possible relaxation rate, set only by temperature



→ Nearly universal conductivity

$$\sigma_{Drude} = \frac{e}{m} \rho \tau \rightarrow \sigma(\mu = 0) \sim \frac{e}{k_B T / v^2} \left( e \frac{(k_B T)^2}{(\hbar v)^2} \right) \frac{\hbar}{\alpha^2 k_B T} \sim \frac{1}{\alpha^2} \frac{e^2}{h}$$

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry (r=0)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum

(particle) (hole)



Pair creation/annihilation leads to current decay

- Finite collision-limited conductivity!
- Marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: Maximal possible relaxation rate, set only by temperature



→ Nearly universal conductivity

$$\sigma_{Drude} = \frac{e}{m} \rho \tau \rightarrow \sigma (\mu = 0) \sim \frac{e}{k_B T / v^2} \left( e \frac{(k_B T)^2}{(\hbar v)^2} \right) \frac{\hbar}{\alpha^2 k_B T} \sim \frac{1}{\alpha^2} \frac{e^2}{h}$$

Marginal irrelevance of Coulomb:

## Back to Hydrodynamics

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

#### **Elements discussed so far:**

Conservation laws (equations of motion):

$$\partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = 0 \qquad \text{Charge conservation} \\ \partial_{\nu}T^{\mu\nu} = F^{\mu\nu}J_{\nu} + \frac{1}{\tau_{\text{imp}}}T^{0\nu}$$

Energy/momentum conservation

Dissipative current (relating electrical and energy current)

$$\nu^{\mu} = \sigma_{Q}(g^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu}u^{\nu}) \left[ \left( -\partial_{\nu}\mu + F_{\nu\lambda}u^{\lambda} \right) + \mu \frac{\partial_{\mu}T}{T} \right]$$

# Thermoelectric response S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Charge and heat current:

$$J^{\mu} = \rho u^{\mu} - v^{\mu}$$
$$Q^{\mu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu} - \mu J^{\mu}$$

Thermo-electric response

#### Thermoelectric response

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovton, MM, and S. Sachdev, Phys. Rev. B 76, 144502 (2007).

Charge and heat current:

$$J^{\mu} = \rho u^{\mu} - v^{\mu}$$
$$Q^{\mu} = (\varepsilon + P)u^{\mu} - \mu J^{\mu}$$

Thermo-electric response

$$\begin{pmatrix} \vec{J} \\ \vec{Q} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \hat{\sigma} & \hat{\alpha} \\ T\hat{\alpha} & \hat{\vec{\kappa}} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \vec{E} \\ -\vec{\nabla}T \end{pmatrix} \qquad \qquad \hat{\sigma} = \begin{pmatrix} \sigma_{xx} & \sigma_{xy} \\ -\sigma_{xy} & \sigma_{xx} \end{pmatrix} \quad \text{etc.}$$

i) Solve linearized conservation laws
ii) Read off the response functions from the dynamic response to initial conditions! (*see Kadanoff & Martin, 1960*)

## Results from Hydrodynamics

#### Response functions at B=0

Symmetry  $z \rightarrow -z$ :  $\sigma_{xy} = \alpha_{xy} = \kappa_{xy} = 0$ 

Longitudinal conductivity:

$$\sigma_{xx}(\omega,k;B=0) = \left(\sigma_Q + \frac{\rho^2}{P+\varepsilon}\frac{\tau}{1-i\omega\tau}\right)$$

Collision-limited conductivity at the quantum critical point r = 0

Drude-like conductivity, divergent for Momentum conservation  $(r \neq 0)!$ 

 $\tau \to \infty, \omega \to 0, \rho \neq 0$ 

#### Response functions at B=0

Symmetry  $z \rightarrow -z$ :  $\sigma_{xy} = \alpha_{xy} = \kappa_{xy} = 0$ 

Longitudinal conductivity:

$$\sigma_{xx}(\omega,k;B=0) = \left(\sigma_Q + \frac{\rho^2}{P+\varepsilon}\frac{\tau}{1-i\omega\tau}\right)$$

Thermal conductivity:

$$\kappa_{xx}(\omega, k; B = 0) = \sigma_Q \frac{\mu^2}{T} + \frac{s^2 T}{P + \varepsilon} \frac{\tau}{1 - i\omega\tau} + \mathcal{O}(k^2)$$

Relativistic Wiedemann-Franz-like relations between  $\sigma$  and  $\kappa$  in the quantum critical window!

### B > 0 : Cyclotron resonance

E.g.: Longitudinal conductivity

$$\sigma_{xx}(\omega) = \sigma_Q \frac{\omega \left(\omega + i\gamma + i\omega_c^2/\gamma\right)}{\left(\omega + i\gamma\right)^2 - \omega_c^2}$$



Pole in the response

$$\omega = \pm \omega_c^{\rm QC} - i\gamma$$

Collective cyclotron frequency of the relativistic plasma

$$\omega_c^{\mathrm{QC}} = \frac{\rho \ B/c}{(\varepsilon + P)/\mathrm{v}_\mathrm{F}^2} \iff \omega_c^{\mathrm{FL}} = \frac{e \ B/c}{m}$$



## B > 0 : Cyclotron resonance

E.g.: Longitudinal conductivity

$$\sigma_{xx}(\omega) = \sigma_Q \frac{\omega \left(\omega + i\gamma + i\omega_c^2/\gamma\right)}{\left(\omega + i\gamma\right)^2 - \omega_c^2}$$



Pole in the response

$$\omega = \pm \omega_c^{\rm QC} - i\gamma$$

Collective cyclotron frequency of the relativistic plasma

$$\omega_{c}^{\mathrm{QC}} = \frac{\rho B/c}{(\varepsilon + P)/v_{\mathrm{F}}^{2}} \iff \omega_{c}^{\mathrm{FL}} = \frac{e B/c}{m}$$

Intrinsic, interaction-induced broadening (↔ Galilean invariant systems: No broadening due to Kohn's theorem)

$$\gamma = \sigma_Q \frac{(B/c)^2}{(\varepsilon + P)/v_F^2}$$

Observable at room temperature in the GHz regime!

#### **Boltzmann Approach**

MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB 2008

- → Recover and refine the hydrodynamic description
- → Describe relativistic-to-Fermiliquid crossover

## Boltzmann approach

L. Fritz, J. Schmalian, MM, and S. Sachdev, PRB 2008

**Boltzmann equation in Born approximation** 



#### Relativistic hydrodynamics from microscopics

#### Does relativistic hydro really apply to graphene even though Coulomb interactions break relativistic invariance?

Yes! Within weak-coupling theory:

Key point: There is a zero ("momentum") mode of the collision integral due to translational invariance of the interactions

The dynamics of the zero mode under an AC driving field reproduces relativistic hydrodynamics at low frequencies.

**Answer until recently: Not much at all!** 

Answer until recently: Not much at all!

**Newest progress from string theory:** 

- 1) Look at "similar" theories which are very strongly coupled, but can be solved exactly
- 2) Try to extract the "generally valid, universal" part of the result and use it as a guide

**Answer until recently: Not much at all!** 

**Newest progress from string theory:** 

- 1) Look at "similar" theories which are very strongly coupled, but can be solved exactly
- 2) Try to extract the "generally valid, universal" part of the result and use it as a guide

Warning: There is no AdS-CFT mapping for graphene itself!

# Compare graphene to: Strongly coupled relativistic liquids

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovtun, MM, S. Sachdev (2007)

Obtain exact results via string theoretical AdS-CFT correspondence

 $\rightarrow$  Response functions in particular strongly coupled relativistic fluids (for maximally supersymmetric Yang Mills theories with  $N \rightarrow \infty$  colors):

# Compare graphene to: Strongly coupled relativistic liquids

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovtun, MM, S. Sachdev (2007)

Obtain exact results via string theoretical AdS–CFT correspondence

 $\rightarrow$  Response functions in particular strongly coupled relativistic fluids (for maximally supersymmetric Yang Mills theories with  $N \rightarrow \infty$  colors):

- Confirm the structure of the hydrodynamic response functions such as s(w).
- Calculate the transport coefficients for a strongly coupled theory!

SUSY - SU(N): 
$$\sigma(\mu = 0) = \sqrt{\frac{2}{9}N^{3/2}}\frac{e^2}{h}$$
;  $\frac{\eta_{shear}}{s}(\mu = 0) = \frac{1}{4\pi}\frac{\hbar}{k_B}$ 

**Interpretation:**  $N^{3/2}$  effective degrees of freedom, strongly coupled:  $\tau T = O(1)$ 







The quantum theory of a black hole in a 3+1-dimensional negatively curved AdS universe is holographically represented by a CFT (the theory of a quantum critical point) in 2+1 dimensions



Maldacena, Gubser, Klebanov, Polyakov, Witten



The quantum theory of a black hole in a 3+1-dimensional negatively curved AdS universe is holographically represented by a CFT (the theory of a quantum critical point) in 2+1 dimensions



Maldacena, Gubser, Klebanov, Polyakov, Witten

The quantum theory of a black hole in a 3+1-dimensional negatively curved AdS universe is holographically represented by a CFT (the theory of a quantum critical point) in 2+1 dimensions

3+1 dimensional AdS space

Dissipation in quantum criticality = waves falling into black hole



A 2+1 dimensional system at its quantum critical point

Kovtun, Policastro, Son

#### Au+Au collisions at RHIC



Quark-gluon plasma can be described by QCD (nearly conformal, critical theory)

Extremely low viscosity fluid!



#### Au+Au collisions at RHIC



Quark-gluon plasma can be described by QCD (nearly conformal, critical theory)

Extremely low viscosity fluid!



$$\frac{\text{SUSY - SU(N):}}{s} (\mu = 0) = \frac{1}{4\pi} \frac{\hbar}{k_B}$$

This IS an extremely low value! Is there a lowest possible value, or a "most perfect" liquid?
### Graphene – a nearly perfect liquid! MM, J. Schmalian, and L. Fritz, (PRL 2009)

#### Anomalously low viscosity (like quark-gluon plasma)

"Heisenberg"

Conjecture from AdS-CFT:

 $\frac{\eta}{s} \sim E_{qp} \tau \ge 1 \longrightarrow \text{Measure of strong coupling:}$ 

$$\frac{\text{shear viscosity}}{\text{entropy density}} = \frac{\eta}{s} \ge \frac{h}{k_B} \frac{1}{4\pi}$$







T. Schäfer, Phys. Rev. A 76, 063618 (2007).A. Turlapov, J. Kinast, B. Clancy, Le Luo, J. Joseph, J. E. Thomas, J. Low Temp. Phys. 150, 567 (2008)

## Electronic consequences of low viscosity?

MM, J. Schmalian, L. Fritz, (PRL 2009)

Expected viscous effects on conductance in non-uniform current flow:

Decrease of conductance with length scale L



# Electronic consequences of low viscosity?

MM, J. Schmalian, L. Fritz, (PRL 2009)

Electronic turbulence in clean, strongly coupled graphene? (or at quantum criticality!) Reynolds number:

$$\mathrm{Re} = \frac{s/k_B}{\eta/\hbar} \times \frac{k_B T}{\hbar v/L} \times \frac{u_{\mathrm{typ}}}{v}$$

# Electronic consequences of low viscosity?

MM, J. Schmalian, L. Fritz, (PRL 2009)

Electronic turbulence in clean, strongly coupled graphene? (or at quantum criticality!) Reynolds number:

$$\mathrm{Re} = \frac{s/k_B}{\eta/\hbar} \times \frac{k_B T}{\hbar v/L} \times \frac{u_{\mathrm{typ}}}{v}$$

Strongly driven mesoscopic systems: (Kim's group [Columbia])

$$L = 1 \mu m$$

$$u_{typ} = 0.1 v$$

$$T = 100K$$
Re ~ 10-100

Complex fluid dynamics! (pre-turbulent flow)

New phenomenon in an electronic system!



- Undoped graphene is strongly \_\_\_\_\_ coupled in a large temperature window!
- Nearly universal strong coupling features in transport; many similarities with strongly coupled critical fluids (described by AdS-CFT)
- Emergent relativistic hydrodynamics at low frequency
- Graphene: Nearly perfect quantum liquid!
  - $\rightarrow$  Possibility of complex (turbulent?) current flow at high bias