Graphene: Relativistic transport in a nearly perfect quantum liquid

Markus Müller

in collaboration with Lars Fritz (Harvard) Subir Sachdev (Harvard) Jörg Schmalian (Iowa)



The Abdus Salam ICTP Trieste

Sean Hartnoll (Harvard) Pavel Kovtun (Victoria)

(AdS/CFT)

ICMP 09, Prague 3rd August, 2009

Outline

- Relativistic physics in graphene, quantum critical systems and conformal field theories
- Strong coupling features in collision-dominated transport
- Comparison with strongly coupled fluids (via AdS-CFT)
- Graphene: an almost perfect quantum liquid

(Semenoff '84, Haldane '88)

Honeycomb lattice of C atoms



Tight binding dispersion



(Semenoff '84, Haldane '88)

Honeycomb lattice of C atoms



Tight binding dispersion



2 massless Dirac cones in the Brillouin zone: (Sublattice degree of freedom ↔ pseudospin)

Close to the two Fermi points **K**, **K'**:

 $H \approx \mathbf{v}_F \left(\vec{\mathbf{p}} - \vec{\mathbf{K}} \right) \cdot \vec{\sigma}_{\text{sublattice}}$ $\rightarrow E_{\mathbf{p}} = \mathbf{v}_F \left| \vec{\mathbf{p}} - \mathbf{K} \right|$

(Semenoff '84, Haldane '88)

Honeycomb lattice of C atoms



Tight binding dispersion



2 massless Dirac cones in the Brillouin zone: (Sublattice degree of freedom ↔ pseudospin)

Fermi velocity (speed of light")

$$H \approx \mathbf{v}_F \left(\vec{\mathbf{p}} - \vec{\mathbf{K}} \right) \cdot \vec{\sigma}_{\text{sublattice}}$$
$$\rightarrow E_{\mathbf{p}} = \mathbf{v}_F \left| \vec{\mathbf{p}} - \mathbf{K} \right|$$

$$V_F \approx 1.1 \cdot 10^6 \,\mathrm{m/s} \approx \frac{c}{300}$$

(Semenoff '84, Haldane '88)

Honeycomb lattice of C atoms



Tight binding dispersion



2 massless Dirac cones in the Brillouin zone: (Sublattice degree of freedom ↔ pseudospin)

Close to the two Fermi points **K**, **K'**:

$$H \approx \mathbf{v}_F \left(\vec{\mathbf{p}} - \vec{\mathbf{K}} \right) \cdot \vec{\sigma}_{\text{sublattice}}$$
$$\rightarrow E_{\mathbf{p}} = \mathbf{v}_F \left| \vec{\mathbf{p}} - \mathbf{K} \right|$$

Fermi velocity (speed of light")

$$_F \approx 1.1 \cdot 10^6 \text{ m/s} \approx \frac{c}{300}$$

Coulomb interactions: Fine structure constant

$$\alpha \equiv \frac{e^2}{\varepsilon \hbar v_F} = O(1)$$

Relativistic fluid at the Dirac point

D. Sheehy, J. Schmalian, Phys. Rev. Lett. 99, 226803 (2007).

• Relativistic plasma physics of interacting particles and holes!



Relativistic fluid at the Dirac point

D. Sheehy, J. Schmalian, Phys. Rev. Lett. 99, 226803 (2007).

- Relativistic plasma physics of interacting particles and holes!
- Strongly coupled, nearly quantum critical fluid at $\mu = 0$



Relativistic fluid at the Dirac point

D. Sheehy, J. Schmalian, Phys. Rev. Lett. 99, 226803 (2007).

- Relativistic plasma physics of interacting particles and holes!
- Strongly coupled, nearly quantum critical fluid at $\mu = 0$



Very similar as at quantum criticality (with z=1, e.g. SIT) and the associated CFT's

1. Tight binding kinetic energy → massless Dirac quasiparticles

$$H_0 = \sum_{\lambda=\pm} \sum_{a=1}^N \int \frac{d^2k}{(2\pi)^2} \lambda v_F k \, \gamma_{\lambda a}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}) \gamma_{\lambda a}(\mathbf{k})$$

2. Coulomb interactions:
Unexpectedly strong!
→ nearly quantum critical!

$$V(\mathbf{q}) = \frac{2\pi e^2}{\varepsilon |\mathbf{q}|}$$

$$H_1 = rac{1}{2} \int rac{d^2 k_1}{(2\pi)^2} rac{d^2 k_2}{(2\pi)^2} rac{d^2 q}{(2\pi)^2} \Psi^\dagger_a(\mathbf{k}_2 - \mathbf{q}) \Psi_a(\mathbf{k}_2) V(\mathbf{q}) \Psi^\dagger_b(\mathbf{k}_1 + \mathbf{q}) \Psi_b(\mathbf{k}_1)$$

1. Tight binding kinetic energy → massless Dirac quasiparticles

$$H_0 = \sum_{\lambda=\pm} \sum_{a=1}^N \int \frac{d^2k}{(2\pi)^2} \lambda v_F k \, \gamma_{\lambda a}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}) \gamma_{\lambda a}(\mathbf{k})$$

2. Coulomb interactions:
Unexpectedly strong!
→ nearly quantum critical!

$$V(\mathbf{q}) = rac{2\pi e^2}{arepsilon |\mathbf{q}|}$$

$$H_1 \;=\; rac{1}{2} \int rac{d^2 k_1}{(2\pi)^2} rac{d^2 k_2}{(2\pi)^2} rac{d^2 q}{(2\pi)^2} \Psi_a^\dagger(\mathbf{k}_2-\mathbf{q}) \Psi_a(\mathbf{k}_2) V(\mathbf{q}) \Psi_b^\dagger(\mathbf{k}_1+\mathbf{q}) \Psi_b(\mathbf{k}_1+\mathbf{q}) \Psi_b(\mathbf{k}_2)$$

Coulomb **only marginally** irrelevant for $\mu = 0$!



1. Tight binding kinetic energy → massless Dirac quasiparticles

$$H_0 = \sum_{\lambda=\pm} \sum_{a=1}^N \int \frac{d^2k}{(2\pi)^2} \lambda v_F k \, \gamma_{\lambda a}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}) \gamma_{\lambda a}(\mathbf{k})$$

2. Coulomb interactions:
Unexpectedly strong!
→ nearly quantum critical!

$$V(\mathbf{q}) = \frac{2\pi e^2}{\varepsilon |\mathbf{q}|}$$

$$H_1 = rac{1}{2} \int rac{d^2 k_1}{(2\pi)^2} rac{d^2 k_2}{(2\pi)^2} rac{d^2 q}{(2\pi)^2} \Psi_a^\dagger(\mathbf{k}_2 - \mathbf{q}) \Psi_a(\mathbf{k}_2) V(\mathbf{q}) \Psi_b^\dagger(\mathbf{k}_1 + \mathbf{q}) \Psi_b(\mathbf{k}_1)$$

Coulomb **only marginally** irrelevant for $\mu = 0$!

RG:

$$\begin{pmatrix} \frac{d\alpha}{d\ell} = -\frac{\alpha^2}{4} + \mathcal{O}(\alpha^3) & \alpha \equiv \frac{e^2}{\epsilon \hbar v_F} = O(1) \\ \alpha(T) = \frac{\alpha^0}{1 + (\alpha^0/4) \ln(\Lambda/T)} \overset{T \to 0}{\sim} \frac{4}{\ln(\Lambda/T)} \end{pmatrix}$$



1. Tight binding kinetic energy → massless Dirac quasiparticles

$$H_0 = \sum_{\lambda=\pm} \sum_{a=1}^N \int \frac{d^2k}{(2\pi)^2} \lambda v_F k \, \gamma_{\lambda a}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}) \gamma_{\lambda a}(\mathbf{k})$$

Strong

coupling!

Interaction dominated (hy .odynamic)

Electron Fermi liquid

- 11

2. Coulomb interactions:
Unexpectedly strong!
→ nearly quantum critical!

$$V(\mathbf{q}) = rac{2\pi e^2}{arepsilon |\mathbf{q}|}$$

 $H_{1} = \frac{1}{2} \int \frac{d^{2}k_{1}}{(2\pi)^{2}} \frac{d^{2}k_{2}}{(2\pi)^{2}} \frac{d^{2}q}{(2\pi)^{2}} \Psi_{a}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}_{2}-\mathbf{q}) \Psi_{a}(\mathbf{k}_{2}) V(\mathbf{q}) \Psi_{b}^{\dagger}(\mathbf{k}_{1}+\mathbf{q}) \Psi_{b}(\mathbf{k}_{1})$

Coulomb **only marginally** irrelevant for $\mu = 0$!

RG:

$$\begin{pmatrix} \frac{d\alpha}{d\ell} = -\frac{\alpha^2}{4} + \mathcal{O}(\alpha^3) & \alpha \equiv \frac{e^2}{\epsilon \hbar v_F} = O(1) \\ \alpha(T) = \frac{\alpha^0}{1 + (\alpha^0/4) \ln(\Lambda/T)} \xrightarrow{T \to 0} \frac{4}{\ln(\Lambda/T)} & \text{Hole Fermi lique} \\ \hline \end{pmatrix}$$

 $(\mu > 0)$ $T < \mu$: Screening kicks in, short ranged Cb irrelevant $\nabla^{Disorder}$

MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

μ > T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

μ > T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



Relaxation rate ~ T, like in quantum critical systems! Fastest possible rate!

μ < T: strongly coupled relativistic liquid



MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

μ > T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



Relaxation rate ~ T, like in quantum critical systems! Fastest possible rate!

μ < T: strongly coupled relativistic liquid



"Heisenberg uncertainty principle for well-defined quasiparticles"

$$E_{qp}(\sim k_B T) \ge \Delta E_{int} = \hbar \tau_{ee}^{-1} \sim \alpha^2 k_B T$$

MM, L. Fritz, and S. Sachdev, PRB '08.

Inelastic scattering rate (Electron-electron interactions)

μ > T: standard 2d Fermi liquid



Relaxation rate ~ T, like in quantum critical systems! Fastest possible rate!

μ < T: strongly coupled relativistic liquid



"Heisenberg uncertainty principle for well-defined quasiparticles"

$$E_{qp}(\sim k_B T) \geq \Delta E_{int} = \hbar \tau_{ee}^{-1} \sim \alpha^2 k_B T$$

As long as $\alpha(T) \sim 1$, energy uncertainty is saturated, scattering is maximal \rightarrow Nearly universal strong coupling features in transport, similarly as at the 2d superfluid-insulator transition [*Damle, Sachdev (1996, 1997)*]

Consequences for transport

- 1. Collisionlimited conductivity σ in clean undoped graphene
- 2. Graphene a perfect quantum liquid: very small viscosity η !

Consequences for transport

1. Collisionlimited conductivity σ in clean undoped graphene

2. Graphene - a perfect quantum liquid: very small viscosity η !

3. Emergent relativistic invariance at low frequencies! Despite the breaking of relativistic invariance by

- finite T,
- finite μ,
- instantaneous 1/r Coulomb interactions

Consequences for transport

1. Collisionlimited conductivity σ in clean undoped graphene

2. Graphene - a perfect quantum liquid: very small viscosity η !

3. Emergent relativistic invariance at low frequencies! Despite the breaking of relativistic invariance by

- finite T,
- finite μ,
- instantaneous 1/r Coulomb interactions

Collision-dominated transport \rightarrow relativistic hydrodynamics:

a) Response fully determined by covariance, thermodynamics, and σ , η

b) Collective cyclotron resonance in small magnetic field (low frequency)

Hydrodynamic regime: (collision-dominated)

$$au_{\mathrm{ee}}^{-1} >> au_{\mathrm{imp}}^{-1}, \omega_{\mathrm{c}}^{\mathrm{typ}}, \omega_{\mathrm{AC}}$$

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry ($\rho = 0$)!

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry ($\rho = 0$)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum



• Finite collision-limited conductivity! $\sigma(\mu = 0) < \infty$; $\sigma(\mu \neq 0) = \infty$

and

• Infinite thermal conductivity!

$$\kappa(\mu=0) = \infty$$
 ; $\kappa(\mu \neq 0) < \infty$

(true also in pure semiconductors)

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry ($\rho = 0$)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum



- Finite collision-limited conductivity! $\sigma(\mu = 0) < \infty$; $\sigma(\mu \neq 0) = \infty$
- Only marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: Maximal possible relaxation rate, set only by temperature

$$\tau_{ee}^{-1} \approx \alpha^2 \frac{k_B T}{\hbar}$$

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry ($\rho = 0$)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum



- Finite collision-limited conductivity! $\sigma(\mu = 0) < \infty$; $\sigma(\mu \neq 0) = \infty$
- Only marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: Maximal possible relaxation rate, set only by temperature

$$\tau_{ee}^{-1} \approx \alpha^2 \, \frac{k_B T}{\hbar}$$

Nearly universal conductivity at strong coupling

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry ($\rho = 0$)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum



- Finite collision-limited conductivity! $\sigma(\mu = 0) < \infty$; $\sigma(\mu \neq 0) = \infty$
- Only marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: Maximal possible relaxation rate, set only by temperature

$$\tau_{ee}^{-1} \approx \alpha^2 \frac{k_B T}{\hbar}$$

-> Nearly universal conductivity at strong coupling

$$\sigma_{Drude} = \frac{e}{m} \rho \tau \rightarrow \sigma(\mu = 0) \sim \frac{e}{k_B T / v^2} \left(e \frac{(k_B T)^2}{(\hbar v)^2} \right) \frac{\hbar}{\alpha^2 k_B T} \sim \frac{1}{\alpha^2} \frac{e^2}{h}$$

Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry ($\rho = 0$)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum



- Finite collision-limited conductivity! $\sigma(\mu = 0) < \infty$; $\sigma(\mu \neq 0) = \infty$
- Only marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: Maximal possible relaxation rate, set only by temperature

$$\tau_{ee}^{-1} \approx \alpha^2 \frac{k_B T}{\hbar}$$

Nearly universal conductivity at strong coupling

$$\sigma_{Drude} = \frac{e}{m} \rho \tau \rightarrow \sigma(\mu = 0) \sim \frac{e}{k_B T / v^2} \left(e \frac{(k_B T)^2}{(\hbar v)^2} \right) \frac{\hbar}{\alpha^2 k_B T} \sim \frac{1}{\alpha^2} \frac{e^2}{h}$$

Marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: $\alpha \approx -\frac{1}{2}$



Damle, Sachdev, (1996). Fritz et al. (2008), Kashuba (2008)

Finite conductivity in a pure system at particle-hole symmetry ($\rho = 0$)!

• Key: Charge current without momentum



- Finite collision-limited conductivity! $\sigma(\mu = 0) < \infty$; $\sigma(\mu \neq 0) = \infty$
- Only marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: Maximal possible relaxation rate, set only by temperature

$$\tau_{ee}^{-1} \approx \alpha^2 \frac{k_B T}{\hbar}$$

 $\log(\Lambda/T)$

 e^2

--> Nearly universal conductivity at strong coupling

$$\sigma_{Drude} = rac{e}{m}
ho au o \sigma(\mu = 0) \sim rac{e}{k_B T/\mathrm{v}^2} \left(e rac{(k_B T)^2}{(\hbar \mathrm{v})^2}
ight) rac{\hbar}{lpha^2 k_B T} \sim rac{e}{lpha}$$

Expect saturation as $\alpha \rightarrow 1$, and eventually phase transition to insulator

Marginal irrelevance of Coulomb: $\alpha \approx \frac{1}{10}$

Boltzmann approach

L. Fritz, J. Schmalian, MM, and S. Sachdev, PRB 2008

Boltzmann equation in Born approximation



Collision-limited conductivity:

$$\sigma(\mu=0) = \frac{0.76}{\alpha^2(T)} \frac{e^2}{h}$$

Beyond weak coupling approximation:

Graphene

\leftrightarrow

Very strongly coupled, critical relativistic liquids?

AdS – CFT !

Au+Au collisions at RHIC





Quark-gluon plasma is described by QCD (nearly conformal, critical theory)

Low viscosity fluid!

Compare graphene to Strongly coupled relativistic liquids

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovtun, MM, S. Sachdev (2007)

Obtain exact results via string theoretical AdS–CFT correspondence

Response functions for particular strongly coupled relativistic fluids (for maximally supersymmetric SU(N) Yang Mills theory with $N \rightarrow \infty$ colors) By mapping to weakly coupled gravity problem:

AdS - CFT [SU(N>>1)]

weak coupling - strong coupling

SU(N) transport from AdS/CFT

Gravitational dual to SUSY SU(N)-CFT $_{2+1}$: Einstein-Maxwell theory

$$I = \frac{1}{g^2} \int d^4 x \sqrt{-g} \left[-\frac{1}{4}R + \frac{1}{4}F_{\mu\nu}F^{\mu\nu} - \frac{3}{2} \right]$$

(embedded in M theory as $AdS_4 \times S^7$: $1/g^2 \sim N^{3/2}$)

It has a black hole solution (with electric and magnetic charge):

$$ds^{2} = \frac{\alpha^{2}}{z^{2}} \left[-f(z)dt^{2} + dx^{2} + dy^{2} \right] + \frac{1}{z^{2}} \frac{dz^{2}}{f(z)},$$

 $F = hlpha^2 dx \wedge dy + qlpha dz \wedge dt$, $f(z) = 1 + (h^2 + q^2)z^4 - (1 + h^2 + q^2)z^3$.

 AdS_{3+1}

z = 0

Electric charge q and magnetic charge, $h \leftrightarrow \mu$ and B for the CFT

Black hole

SU(N) transport from AdS/CFT

Gravitational dual to SUSY SU(N)-CFT₂₊₁: Einstein-Maxwell theory

$$I = \frac{1}{g^2} \int d^4 x \sqrt{-g} \left[-\frac{1}{4}R + \frac{1}{4}F_{\mu\nu}F^{\mu\nu} - \frac{3}{2} \right]$$

(embedded in M theory as $AdS_4 \times S^7$: $1/g^2 \sim N^{3/2}$)

It has a black hole solution (with electric and magnetic charge):



Compare graphene to Strongly coupled relativistic liquids

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovtun, MM, S. Sachdev (2007)

Obtain exact results via string theoretical AdS–CFT correspondence

• Confirm the structure of the hydrodynamic response functions $\sigma(\omega)$ etc.

• Allow to calculate the transport coefficients for a strongly coupled theory!

SUSY - SU(N):
$$\sigma(\mu = 0) = \sqrt{\frac{2}{9}} N^{3/2} \frac{e^2}{h}$$

Compare graphene to Strongly coupled relativistic liquids

S. Hartnoll, P. Kovtun, MM, S. Sachdev (2007)

Obtain exact results via string theoretical AdS–CFT correspondence

• Confirm the structure of the hydrodynamic response functions $\sigma(\omega)$ etc.

• Allow to calculate the transport coefficients for a strongly coupled theory!

SUSY - SU(N):
$$\sigma(\mu = 0) = \sqrt{\frac{2}{9}} N^{3/2} \frac{e^2}{h}$$
; $\frac{\eta_{shear}}{s} (\mu = 0) = \frac{1}{4\pi} \frac{\hbar}{k_B}$

Graphene – a nearly perfect liquid! MM, J. Schmalian, and L. Fritz, (PRL 2009)

Anomalously low viscosity (like quark-gluon plasma)

"Heisenberg"

Conjecture from AdS-CFT:

Graphene – a nearly perfect liquid! MM, J. Schmalian, and L. Fritz, (PRL 2009) Anomalously low viscosity (like quark-gluon plasma) $- \sim E_{qp} \tau \ge 1$ \longrightarrow Measure of strong coupling: "Heisenberg" shear viscosity η Conjecture from entropy density k_{R} AdS-CFT: S Doped Graphene & $\eta \propto n \cdot m v^2 \cdot \tau \rightarrow n \cdot E_F \cdot \frac{\hbar E_F}{(k_P T)^2}$ $s \propto k_B n \frac{T}{E_-}$ ħ ($\left(\underline{E_F}\right)$ Fermi liquids: (*Khalatnikov etc*)

Graphene – a nearly perfect liquid! MM, J. Schmalian, and L. Fritz, (PRL 2009) Anomalously low viscosity (like quark-gluon plasma) $\frac{\eta}{c} \sim E_{qp} \tau \ge 1 \quad \longrightarrow \text{ Measure of strong coupling:}$ "Heisenberg" shear viscosity $\underline{\eta}$. Conjecture from entropy density k_{R} 4π AdS-CFT: S Doped Graphene & $\sim \frac{\hbar}{E_F}$ $\eta \propto n \cdot m v^2 \cdot \tau \rightarrow n \cdot E_F \cdot \frac{\hbar E_F}{(k_B T)^2} \quad s \propto k_B n \frac{T}{E_F}$ Fermi liquids: (Khalatnikov etc) $\eta \propto n \cdot m v^2 \cdot \tau \rightarrow n_{\rm th} \cdot k_B T \cdot \frac{\hbar}{\alpha^2 k_B T} = \frac{\hbar}{\alpha^2} n_{\rm th}$ $s \propto k_B n_{\rm th}$ Undoped Graphene: ħ 0.13 \hbar 0.449π Exact (Boltzmann-Born Approx): $\overline{k_B}$ · $\overline{9\zeta(3)\alpha^2(T)}$ k_B $\alpha^2(T)$



T. Schäfer, Phys. Rev. A **76**, 063618 (2007). *A. Turlapov, J. Kinast, B. Clancy, Le Luo, J. Joseph, J. E. Thomas, J. Low Temp. Phys.* **150**, 567 (2008)

Electronic consequences of low viscosity?

MM, J. Schmalian, L. Fritz, (PRL 2009)

Electronic turbulence in clean, strongly coupled graphene? (or at quantum criticality!) Reynolds number:

$$\mathrm{Re} = \frac{s/k_B}{\eta/\hbar} \times \frac{k_B T}{\hbar v/L} \times \frac{u_{\mathrm{typ}}}{v}$$

Electronic consequences of low viscosity?

MM, J. Schmalian, L. Fritz, (PRL 2009)

Electronic turbulence in clean, strongly coupled graphene? (or at quantum criticality!) Reynolds number:

$$\mathrm{Re} = \frac{s/k_B}{\eta/\hbar} \times \frac{k_B T}{\hbar v/L} \times \frac{u_{\mathrm{typ}}}{v}$$

Strongly driven mesoscopic systems: (Kim's group [Columbia])

$$L = 1 \mu m$$

$$u_{typ} = 0.1 v$$

$$T = 100 K$$
Re ~ 10-100

Complex fluid dynamics! (pre-turbulent flow)

New phenomenon in an electronic system!



- Nearly universal strong coupling features in transport; many similarities with strongly coupled critical fluids (described by AdSCFT)
- Emergent relativistic hydrodynamics at low frequency
- Graphene: Nearly perfect quantum liquid!
 - \rightarrow Possibility of complex (turbulent?) current flow at high bias